

Planning Commission
September 26, 2016
Minutes

The Planning Commission Meeting was called to order by Chairman Stanard at 6:18 pm.

PRESENT AT ROLL CALL: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard
ABSENT: Mr. Bolek

Other Present: Jeff Filarski, Village Engineer; Aimee Lane, Law Director; Paul Kowalczyk, Building Official; Theresa Dean, Assistant Clerk

Mr. Stanard made a motion seconded by Mrs. Cooper to approve the minutes from the Regular Planning Commission Meeting of August 22, 2016.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Taylor Residence - Protected Hillside Zone

279 Bentleyville Road

Richard Siegfried of RSA Architects was in attendance to represent the project, which is a new detached garage to replace the existing garage. Mr. Siegfried said that plans also include improved drainage and some excavation to create a usable yard. The rest of the hillside will remain untouched as much as possible except to run a drainage pipe. Mr. Siegfried distributed photos of existing conditions on the hillside and reiterated that no trees needed to be removed for the project.

Mr. Stanard asked Mr. Filarski to clarify which hillside is being considered, as there appears to be multiple hillsides on the site. Mr. Filarski replied that there is just one hillside coming down from Bentleyville Road but there are multiple angles. Mr. Filarski also replied that, from an engineering standpoint, the stability of the hillside will not be reduced.

In light of the geotechnical report and the recommendation of the Village Engineer, Mr. Stanard made a motion seconded by Mayor Renda to approve the Protected Hillside Zoning certificate.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Taylor Residence - Detached Garage
279 Bentleyville Road

Mr. Siegfried, RSA Architects, presented the design for the proposed new garage. It will match the existing house; Mr. Siegfried distributed photos of the house and an existing retaining wall.

Mr. Kowalczyk reported that the Village Architect approved the plans as submitted with no comments.

Mr. Stanard asked if there would be utilities in the new garage; Mr. Siegfried replied that there would be electric and a floor drain but no plumbing.

Mr. Fritz asked if there were any plans for living space above the garage; Mr. Siegfried said no, it would be used for storage only.

Mrs. Cooper noted that a shed was shown on the site plan. Mr. Siegfried said it would be removed, as the additional storage in the new garage would alleviate the need for a storage shed. It was also noted that the total square footage of the garage is one-thousand, four-hundred fifty-two (1,452) square feet, which exceeds the allowable aggregate limit of one-thousand (1,000) square feet for accessory buildings. However, Mrs. Cooper pointed out that the square footage of basements is not included. Therefore, the square footage of the garage does not exceed the allowable limit.

Mrs. Cooper made a motion seconded by Mr. Stanard to approve the new detached garage at 279 Bentleyville Road.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Regan Residence - Deck
80 Sterncrest

Nick Regan, homeowner, and David Pfeiffer, Woodland Deck, were in attendance. Mr. Pfeiffer displayed photos of the existing deck as well as elevations of the proposed deck. There is a small structure underneath the existing deck that is collapsing. Mr. Regan said it will be removed with the installation of the new deck.

Mr. Stanard confirmed with Mr. Kowalczyk that the plans were reviewed by the Village Architect and approved as submitted with no comments.

Mr. Fritz made a motion seconded by Mayor Renda to approve the new side/rear deck at 80 Sterncrest.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Deutsch Residence - Solarium, Patio

32570 Hiram Trail

Mr. Deutsch, homeowner, was in attendance to present his plans. The proposal is for the addition of a hardscape deck with an outdoor kitchen and fire pit and a solarium room that can be used year-round by enclosing it in the winter and having it screened in the summer. The solarium and deck are tucked into the back of the house and will not be visible to neighbors. The solarium has the same roofline and pitch as the house, as it was part of the home's original design but was not completed at the same time.

Mr. Kowalczyk reported that the Village Architect approved the plans as submitted with no comments.

Mr. Deutsch pointed out features of the new solarium, which will be raised to be even with the floor of the master bedroom and enable a hot tub to be installed at a future time without requiring steps. He also explained the layout of the exterior kitchen and how the sink backs up to the sink in the kitchen and utilizes an interior drain to avoid freezing in the winter.

Mrs. Cooper asked if there is a roof above the bar area, and Mr. Deutsch replied that there will be a reinforced glass structure. Drainage has been planned to address groundwater issues and reduce demand on their basement sump pump.

Neither Mr. Filarski nor Mr. Kowalczyk had any concerns about the project.

Mr. Fritz made a motion seconded by Mr. Pogatschnik to approve the solarium and exterior patio at 32570 Hiram Trail.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Fruscella Residence - Attached Garage

15 Fairway Trail

Mr. Fruscella, homeowner, and Richard Cissell of Clemens Pantuso Architecture attended to represent the project. The home has an existing garage, and a second, three-car attached garage with a walk-out roof terrace is being proposed. Mr. Cissell displayed elevations of the proposed project and also a site plan, which was done by a landscape architect firm, Aristotle Design Group. The access drive for the new garage is proposed to come off of Pebblebrook. The landscape architect is working with Mr. Fruscella on the proposed drive and landscaping, while Clemens Pantuso Architecture is working on the garage design.

Mr. Fruscella spoke to say that he is a car collector. He currently lives in Bentleyville and has nine garages at that home; this proposed garage will be used to store part of his collection, and the drive will be used rarely, perhaps only four to five times per year. He decided to put the additional garage in the back of house so it is not visible. It will be underground due to the slope of the land, and he is willing to do any necessary landscaping to make the site attractive.

Mr. Stanard clarified that the new driveway being referenced does not currently exist and asked what would happen if the garage is approved but the drive is not. Mr. Cissell replied that there is an option to access the new garage from the existing drive by going around the house. He was not sure how close the landscape architect is to finalizing a driveway plan. Mr. Stanard also asked how soon Mr. Fruscella wants to begin construction, and Mr. Fruscella said he would like to begin immediately. Mr. Fruscella also added there is no driveway across the street from the proposed additional driveway nor any obstructions that would need to be addressed. Mr. Stanard asked if there are constraints to having multiple driveways to a property. Mr. Filarski replied that there is nothing in the Village's Ordinances but wondered if there might be restrictions per the bylaws of a Home Owners Association, even though the Village does not enforce HOA bylaws. Mr. Filarski did say that Mr. Fruscella would need to provide grading and drainage plans for driveway approval. Mr. Fritz asked what requirements the Village would have if Mr. Fruscella opted not to have the second driveway but rather extend the existing drive around the house. Mr. Filarski replied he would need a grading plan and that it should be doable without needing a variance.

Mr. Stanard confirmed with Filarski that there was no hillside or wetland to traverse with either driveway option.

Mr. Kowalczyk reported that the Village Architect, Dick Kawalek, reviewed and approved the plans but with comments requiring a site and driveway plan, which have since been received. Mr. Kawalek also asked for a tree plan showing what trees might need to be removed and whether any consideration had been given to screening the new garage's doors from the public way. Finally, he made note that any brick used should match the brick on the existing house. Mr. Cissell replied that the site is fairly heavily screened now, so except that there could be small glimpse of the garage from the end of the proposed new driveway, the garage should not be visible. Mr. Fruscella pointed out photos showing the existing deck that will come down and be replaced by the terrace roof of the new garage. He said there are no other house or drives across from the proposed new drive.

Mr. Fruscella said that there are several ash trees that would need to be removed but didn't know if permits would be required. Mr. Kowalczyk said that trees can be removed if they are diseased and dying. Mr. Fruscella replied that he has consulted with a tree expert who feels they should be removed.

Mrs. Cooper verified that the side yard setback is acceptable.

Mr. Stanard asked Mr. Kowalczyk to review the Village Architect's comments again, which he did. Mr. Stanard felt that all issues have been addressed.

Mr. Cissell mentioned that the windows and doors on the side of the home where the garage will be added need to be rearranged, an elevator is being added, and two sky lights will be removed. All modifications were included in the submitted drawings. Mr. Fruscella assured the Planning Commission that all work will be first-class.

Mayor Renda made a motion seconded by Mr. Stanard to approve the garage addition at 15 Fairway Trail.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Chagrin Bluffs Subdivision - Final Plat Acceptance

551 Chagrin Boulevard

Larry Bloch of Larry Bloch Builders was in attendance. Mr. Bloch said that he and Jason Friedman, the developer, were looking for final acceptance of the street and asked Mr. Filarski if there were any additional issues to be addressed. Mr. Filarski replied that approval of a plat is a multi-step process and that all requirements have been met so far. The final steps are for the Planning Commission and the Service and Facilities Committees of Council to approve the plat, which will then go to Council for approval of the plat and public areas for dedication.

Title insurance is also required to guarantee full, free clearance to title. Mrs. Lane reported that it was received earlier this same day but that the provision for the amount of the title insurance was listed as "to be determined." A nominal amount of one-thousand dollars (\$1,000) is typical, so this will need to be specified.

Mr. Filarski said his recommendation is to approve the plat.

Mr. Fritz asked Mr. Filarski about the easement that was originally defined to enable the road to be built. Mr. Filarski said the latest version of the plat contains a clause extinguishing the prior plat and, therefore, the easement.

Mrs. Lane commented that the Planning Commission can approve the plat but that the Council Committees still need to give their approval and that Council needs to accept dedication through legislation.

Mr. Stanard confirmed that there were no further engineering issues to be addressed and that there is nothing the Village Architect needs to review.

Mr. Stanard made a motion seconded by Mr. Fritz to approve the final plat at 551 Chagrin Boulevard, soon to be known as Addison Lane, with the condition that the title insurance application stipulate an amount of one-thousand dollars (\$1,000) in lieu of "to be determined."

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Talisman - New Dwelling
15 Addison Lane (S/L 1)

Henry Piper, architect for the project, was in attendance. They are proposing a ranch home to minimize the size of the home. It will include three bedrooms and two bathrooms in a daylight basement. It is styled as an English country cottage and will feature brick treated to appear antique, sloped roofs, and asphalt shingles. It will be an all-brick home. Mr. Piper displayed elevations of the proposed home.

Mayor Renda asked what defines a daylight basement. Mr. Piper answered that it is a basement that has "legitimate" windows bigger than the two-foot, eight-inch (2'8") by one-foot, four-inch (1'4") glass block panels typically used for basements. When sleeping rooms are in the basement, the Building Code requires that there be an exit window with a sill no higher than forty-two inches (42") and that, if exiting into a well, a ladder or steps be included in the well to enable egress. In this case, no wells are needed due to the slope of the ground.

Mr. Kowalczyk reported that the Village Architect had several comments about the elevations. Mr. Kawalek felt that the design was somewhat preliminary and asked that Mr. Piper revisit the left (east) elevation and consider adding openings in the wall. Mr. Kawalek also commented on the roofline, stated it appeared to be a hard, straight edge and asking if it could slope back. Mr. Piper replied that it is a gable end, so there is nothing unusual about the roof line.

Mrs. Cooper asked Mr. Piper to comment on the roof pitch shown on the front (north) roof elevations. Mr. Piper replied that it is a swept roof pitch. It is a stylistic feature that the owner requested, so Mr. Piper is trying to blend it into the design. It is meant to be curved and is very common in this style of home.

As to adding windows to the east side of the home, Mr. Piper said it might be possible to add a window, but it is a twenty-four-foot (24') appliance wall. Mrs. Cooper asked about the view of the home from Chagrin Boulevard. Mr. Piper said the view would look substantially down on the home from Chagrin Boulevard. Mr. Filarski added that it is a heavily wooded lot located approximately thirty-five feet (35') down from street level. Mrs. Cooper said that she did not think the kitchen wall would be a problem, as it would not be seen.

Mr. Stanard noted the comment from the Village Architect that the plans seemed preliminary, and Mrs. Lane said that it would be possible for the Planning Commission to approve the plan contingent upon final approval from both Mr. Kowalczyk and Mr. Kawalek.

Mrs. Cooper clarified that it was the predominate pitch on the roof that was being considered when determining the number of roof pitches. The swept pitch of the roof line is stylistic and is not counted as a separate pitch.

Mr. Stanard asked Mr. Filarski if he had any issues with the placement of the home on the lot, which he did not. Mr. Filarski did say that there were a few minor details on the site plan to be addressed.

Mrs. Cooper made a motion seconded by Mayor Renda to approve the new dwelling at 15 Addison Lane, S/L 1 contingent upon final approval of the Village Architect, Building Commissioner, and Village Engineer.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Hedaya - New Dwelling

10 Addison Lane (S/L 8)

Mr. Piper is also the architect for this proposed dwelling and presented the project. This home is proposed to be a two-story dwelling with the master on the first floor, a porch on the back, and a four-car garage. The lot is relatively level, and the home is raised slightly to allow for a daylight basement on the side facing Chagrin Boulevard.

Mr. Kowalczyk reviewed Richard Kawalek's comments. Mr. Kawalek felt that this design was also at a preliminary stage. His two comments were, "Assume no adjacent homes of dissimilar design," and "The elevations appear rather plain and boxy, and some consideration should be given to adjusting proportions and adding details to the home."

Mr. Piper replied that the design was derived from something the owners saw on the website houzz.com. It is a semi-contemporary, Tuscan-style home with tinted stucco. The Hedayas want a home with very clean lines, so it is intended to look somewhat plain.

Mr. Bloch also spoke to say that potential owners in the development have been asking for a variety of home styles and do not desire a neighborhood where everything looks alike. Mr. Fritz recalled a previous discussion about home designs in this area where it was stated that the Village is open to diversity but that there are aesthetic limits.

Mr. Filarski said he only has some minor concerns about the site plan. Mr. Bloch and Mr. Piper said they are willing to meet with the Village Architect and address his concerns but are not entirely sure what he wants. The owners really want this style of home. Mr. Piper stated that the subdivision somewhat stands by itself due to the geographic features of the land and doubts that anyone will want to build a home so dissimilar as to be a distraction. Mrs. Cooper confirmed that this house will be visible from Chagrin Boulevard; it will be visible when driving west but not when traveling east.

Mrs. Cooper commented that there are three levels of windows that look out of balance. Mr. Piper said that this is a stairwell, with the lowest windows letting light into the basement level.

Mayor Renda made a motion seconded by Mr. Stanard to approve the new dwelling at 10 Addison Lane, S/L 8, contingent upon final approval by the Village Architect, Building Commissioner, and Village Engineer.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Mr. Kowalczyk commented that he would need the permanent parcel numbers once the plat is recorded with the county before any permits could be issued.

As there were no items for discussion, Mr. Pogatschnik made a motion seconded by Mr. Stanard to adjourn the Planning Commission meeting at 7:28 pm.

ROLL CALL:

AYES: Mrs. Cooper, Mr. Fritz, Mr. Pogatschnik, Mayor Renda, Mr. Stanard

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED

Respectfully Submitted,



Theresa Dean
Theresa Dean, Assistant Clerk